Hegelian version of σε, which is the ideal and absolute place for humans to live, is only achieved at the end of time. Humans can live in this proper place only when time is fulfilled and contradictions of the Spirit disappear (124). Only then, humans could shed external restrictions and limitations and be the source for their own actions.

As one can see, Agamben, inspired by Hegel, argues that the true home for human beings is where they can be source and ground for their actions. This messianic and apocalyptic vision of human dwelling place, for Agamben, is the true understanding of life, which is outside law because, firstly, at the end of time every single law will be already abdicated. Moreover, because humans will be the source for their actions, none of their measures and actions will be defensive and reactionary to outer forces. Only then the Spirit of Christ/truth can meditatio inside us in every moment of our daily life, which is our true habit or dwelling place. Briefly, Agamben in this book, through critical analysis of form-of-life among Franciscans, well explores his crypto-Hegelian notion of ethos.

Amin Mansouri
University of British Columbia


The transformative potential in pilgrimage exists not solely during the experience, but also in the stages prior to and following a pilgrimage. Although this theme is common in the anthropology of pilgrimage, the latter processes are often overlooked; an aspect of pilgrimage studies that Hillary Kaell aims to remedy with her inaugural book, Walking Where Jesus Walked. Developed from her doctoral thesis, Kaell engages with American Christian pilgrims and pilgrimage organizers in an exploration of what it means to be a modern American Christian abroad in a globally commercial world. This book is of great value to anyone working with pilgrimage, transnational exchange, or the adaptability of spiritual and personal boundaries.

Kaell explains her objectives in the introduction: an ethnographic exploration of the point where pilgrimage and the economy intersect, the complexities of what it means to “walk where Jesus walked” for modern Christians, and how Americans deal with anxieties that present when negotiating their identities abroad as ‘American’ and ‘Christian’ simultaneously. She identifies these as three key dichotomies, “home/away, transcendent/material, religion/commerce” (199), perhaps in reference to Ellen Badone’s work on polarities in Christian pilgrimage centres. Six chapters and a conclusion follow the introduction. Kaell uses archival research in the first chapter to understand how the tourism industry has procured an instrumental role in the pilgrimage market. The second chapter introduces the pilgrims and their inspiration before departure. Chapters three, four, and five cover their experiences in the Holy Land (Israel and Palestine) and investigate themes of materiality, Catholicism, and social tension, respectively. The final chapter returns home with the pilgrims, and in the conclusion Kaell discusses her results.

Kaell argues for a “more comprehensive map” (200) of the potential within pilgrimage to reorder ‘home’ as physical and intellectual space, and to alter how the pilgrims understand their roles in personal relationships with their peers and Jesus Christ. In order to situate the experience of the contemporary American Holy Land pilgrim within the contexts of identity negotiation and global commerce, Kaell shifts the focus of pilgrimage from the shrine to the peripheral
experience through qualitative interviews with interlocutors in the months both before and after their pilgrimages. The Holy Land pilgrimage market has been growing steadily for the last fifty years, and Kaell sees the agency over spiritual development with which it equips pilgrims to be a crucial influence of the modern religious narrative.

To understand how pilgrims attempt to claim their right as autonomous individuals while still engaging in “a sense of mutual obligation” (205), Kaell explores the junction between the transcendent and the material while challenging traditional notions of *communitas* and untroubled expeditions. The pilgrims struggle to amend their moral model of the ‘Holy Land’ at every stage of their journey due to the reality of the landscape as a politically charged region. The material and the transcendent meet not in an immediate understanding, but in an uncomfortable re-evaluation of what it means to be an American Christian as they engage in commercial tourism to Israel and Palestine.

A common critique of commercially-organized pilgrimage is the supposed “Disneyization” (204) of sacred travel experiences, where corporations reduce something once profound to an expensive thematic vacation; an opinion, Kael adds, often voiced by the same parties in debates about American Christianity at large. When considering the religion/commerce association, Kaell identifies the motivating factors behind “mass market pilgrimage” (12): not in terms of flashing lights but of agency—the choices enabled by the security of an established commercial pilgrimage experience that grants pilgrims a sense of ownership over the experience. A refreshing change to the “Disneyization” discourse, Kaell looks beyond the immediate effects of the commercialization of religion to underline how those same economic developments have enabled the pilgrims to feel more connected with the spiritual choices they make.

Kaell sought to understand how modern American Christians attempt to make the divine tangible through pilgrimage, and her extensive fieldwork enabled a study which exposes readers to elements of the self in pilgrimage—agency, identification, and location—that now appear too often overlooked. *Walking Where Jesus Walked* fits neatly alongside the work of Anna Fedele into a recent but growing corpus of pilgrimage literature that takes a holistic approach to engaging with both pilgrimage consumers and pilgrimage organizers. Such studies elucidate experiences at the periphery of what is most often disclosed, yielding compelling results for those in the fields of modern American Christianity and pilgrimage studies.

Kaleigh McLelland
Department for the Study of Religion
University of Toronto


Craig Martin’s *A Critical Introduction to the Study of Religion* is a welcome addition to the market of introductory textbooks in religious studies. Rather than rehashing the content-driven survey model, Martin provides his readers with the tools to examine how those elements of culture often classified as religious¹ “can be used to create, maintain, and contest social order” (189). Intended for undergraduates of all stripes—from non-majors fulfilling general requirements, to majors with their eyes on graduate school—

¹ Rather than repeating this rather complicated phrase, I use the words “religious” and “religion” throughout this review in this sense.